

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CONTRACT
WITH
UNIVERSIDADE DE SÃO PAULO

ESCOLA SUPERIOR DE AGRICULTURA "LUIZ DE QUEIROZ"

PIRACICABA - ESTADO DE SÃO PAULO

AMERICAN CONSULATE, S. P., US/AID-B, APO NEW YORK 09676



July 11, 1967.

Mr. Jerome Hulehan
Asst. Program Officer
ARDO/USAID
American Embassy
Rio de Janeiro.

Dear Mr. Hulehan:

When I received copies of "Nutrição Animal por Maynard e Loosli" for distribution I scanned the book and was embarrassed by the quality of the translation. This book is being used with some considerable difficulty as it appears that a translator is needed to translate the translated text since Cicero Green apparently saw fit to invent his own personal jargon.

I have received the enclosed letter from Professor Chefe of our Department of Zootecnia, speaking for all the catedráticos relative to animal husbandry. It is self explanatory and poses a real question for us. Should this book be withdrawn from circulation? I believe in general Professor Aristeu Peixoto's letter is entirely justified. It is obvious that the book's translator, Cicero Green, is no nutritionist, biochemist, or physiologist. In my view this is a boondoggle so obvious that it undermines the position of every university program in Brazil. USAID apparently did not have Green's copy checked by competent animal nutritionists and Green is not a competent scientist. It is absurd that USAID should think that any person supposedly conversant in common Portuguese and English is competent to translate a high level scientific text. Green simply did not understand what he was reading in the original and was therefore unable to put the basic concepts of the book into Portuguese nor to even use the commonly accepted Portuguese terminology in the field of nutrition and the relevant basic sciences of biochemistry and physiology.

This and other grossly obvious errors in the book program puts USAID and those of us who work with the universities in a very bad light. We are supposed to be setting examples on educational programs and yet are placed in the position of apologizing for and explaining away these inefficiencies. It is doubly bad because we advertise this to all the students who try to use the book as well. It is unfortunate that where we are trying to develop a system of university education based on good textbooks we give the student a book to use that the educational and scientific communities in the U.S.A. would not tolerate - indeed a book that if a U.S. publisher would try to release and sell in the U.S.A. he not only would lose the respect of these communities and much money as well but he would lose many future publishing opportunities. You will note that rather than have the proud hallmark of the publisher so common in the U.S.A. we note in this book on the title page "Programa de Publicações Didáticas USAID". U.S. publishers of university level texts are all very careful to have manuscripts checked by competent scientists and scholars - independent of the authors - before publication. Certainly USAID should do as well.

committed, as for example the use of the expression teor iodado das gorduras in place of índice de iodo das gorduras. In another instance the translator ventured into supplementing his work, adding erroneous and needless

In view of the foregoing comments I now pose the question once again. How is our book program progressing? As far as I know USAID Publications in Rio has yet to contact a single translator of any text the USAID Education Committee has selected. It is now almost a year since the books and translators were selected.

Dear Dr. Deatherage:
I am sending copies of this letter and Dr. Peixoto's letter to several members of the Education Committee, which I hope can meet soon and consider this matter further. You will note that I am also sending copies to Dr. Newberg. Included also are additional copies for Minister Van Dyke which you might wish to forward on to him.

I send you my very best wishes.

Sincerely yours, D-Brazil in

I believe it is our duty to watch over the teaching material in which we carry out our teaching activities. For student consultation and guidance in their

The Portuguese translation of the above mentioned book by Mr. Cicero Green, whom we do not know personally, evidently does not fit in as a textbook which can be recommended for students of agriculture or veterinary medicine. I am interested in livestock nutrition due to the many shortcomings that

FED/mpw

cc: Dr. R. Newberg.

A superficial examination of the several chapters reveals the fact that the translator is not familiar with the terminology used in Portuguese in the area of nutrition. A literal translation was adopted in most cases to remedy this deficiency, and revealed a complete ignorance of the technical terms equivalent in our language, jeopardized greatly the value of the work which, in addition to being imperfect in this respect, is of questionable value for students of the subject.

It would be superfluous to list herein the numerous mistakes committed. Just to illustrate the seriousness of the situation, we might only point out the following which are more critical: índice amiláceo (valor amido), índice biológico (valor biológico), parachoque (poder tampão), inchação (meteorismo ou timpanismo), entulho (forragens volumosas ou grosseiras), nutrientes totalmente digeríveis (nutrientes digestíveis totais), proteínas autotônicas (proteínas reais), índice antioxidante lipídico (capacidade lipídica), propagação nutricional (relação nutricional), salutar (saudável), and many others which jeopardize a work which was published for teaching purposes.

An analysis more in depth also shows that the person responsible for the translation is not a specialist on the subject covered by the book written by these two distinguished American professors of Cornell University. Oftentimes statements are presented in a manner not very clear and in conflict with well known observations of confirmed facts, and may be misleading to any reader who is not too familiar with the subject matter. Just as an example we might mention some of the concepts discussed under items 4.21, 5.20, 6.19, 6.22, 7.19, 12.8, 14.16 and 14.38.

Furthermore, the translator did not fully understand the author's thoughts on some physiological processes involved in animal nutrition and he gave distorted and confused interpretation to many facts. Mistakes that are inexcusable in a technical work which is proposed for teaching purposes were committed, as for example the use of the expression teor iodado das gorduras in place of índice de iodo das gorduras. In another instance the translator ventured into supplementing his work, adding erroneous and needless

Piracicaba, July 3, 1967.

Prof. Fred Deatherage
ESALQ-OSU-USAID Contract

Dear Dr. Deatherage:

As Head of the Department of Animal Husbandry and Professor of Animal Husbandry (Chair Nº 5) of the Escola Superior de Agricultura "Luiz de Queiróz", of the Universidade de São Paulo, I take the liberty of writing you in order to indicate my opinion about the Portuguese translation of book "Animal Nutrition", by Maynard & Loosli, and which was published under the sponsorship of the Textbook Publication Program of the USAID-Brasil in 1966.

I believe it is our duty to watch over the teaching within the specialization in which we carry out our teaching activities by recommending good textbooks for student consultation and guidance in their learning.

The Portuguese translation of the above mentioned book by Mr. Cicero Green, whom we do not know personally, evidently does not fit in as a textbook which can be recommended for students of agriculture or veterinary medicine who are interested in livestock nutrition due to the many shortcomings that it presents.

A superficial examination of the several chapters reveals the fact that the translator is not familiar with the terminology used in Portuguese in the area of nutrition. A literal translation was adopted in most cases to remedy this deficiency, and revealed a complete ignorance of the technical terms equivalent in our language, jeopardized greatly the value of the work which, in addition to being imperfect in this respect, is of questionable value for students of the subject.

It would be superfluous to list herein the numerous mistakes committed. Just to illustrate the seriousness of the situation, we might only point out the following which are more critical: índice amiláceo (valor amido), índice biológico (valor biológico), parachoque (poder tampão), inchaço (meteorismo ou timpanismo), entulho (forragens volumosas ou grosseiras), nutrientes totalmente digeríveis (nutrientes digestíveis totais), proteína autêntica (proteína real), índice energético líquido (energia líquida), proporção nutritiva (relação nutritiva), enxofre (sulfur), and many others which jeopardize a work which was published for teaching purposes.

An analysis more in depth also shows that the person responsible for the translation is not a specialist on the subject covered by the book written by these two distinguished American professors of Cornell University. Oftentimes statements are presented in a manner not very clear and in conflict with well known observations of confirmed facts, and may be misleading to any reader who is not too familiar with the subject matter. Just as an example we might mention some of the concepts discussed under items 4.21, 5.20, 6.19, 6.22, 7.19, 12.8, 14.16 and 14.38.

Furthermore, the translator did not fully understand the author's thoughts on some physiological processes involved in animal nutrition and he gave distorted and confused interpretation to many facts. Mistakes that are inexcusable in a technical work which is proposed for teaching purposes were committed, as for example the use of the expression teor iodado das gorduras in place of índice de iodo das gorduras. In another instance the translator ventured into supplementing his work, adding erroneous and needless

additional information on his own, such as in the case of "cenurose" of sheep, which was presumably presented as a deficiency of magnesium in the feed.

In chapter 2, item 2.6, the translator made a very serious mistake when he confused silagem with fenação and, likewise, in chapter 8 when he refers to dieta isenta de eter para galinhas (diet free of ether for chickens).

Another important correction that should be made is the lack of uniformity of the nomenclature used, a serious mistake in a book intended to serve as a guide in learning. Quite frequently different words were used to mean the same thing, v.g. proteinica, proteica and protidia, or iodico and iodado or nitrogenado and nitrogenoso, as well as nutricional, nutriencial and nutritivo, and many others.

The Portuguese was not the best either. Certain terms and expressions do not exist in this language and should not have been used, v.g. cambaleamento, nutriencial, proteinico, etc. On the other hand, some expressions which are easily translated were kept in the same order as the original English: - proteino-síntese, germe-esteréis, nitrogenio-livre, proteino-oxigências, fluor-toxidez, manganes-carente.

Those accustomed to consulting specialized bibliographies are surprised at the unnecessary concern in translating references, book titles and journals listed at the bottom of the pages and at the end of each chapter. This procedure, in our viewpoint, departs completely from the technique of translation of scientific books, in addition to presenting questionable validity. To be consistent, the German and French books should have been translated also.

Finally, we also find it strange that on dealing with a book of a specialized nature, a technician of the matter was not consulted for a final revision. With this simple precaution the serious errors and inconveniences that have been pointed out could have been avoided.

In view of the above, and after discussing the matter with several members of the Dept. of Animal Husbandry of ESALQ, we are of the opinion that this Portuguese edition of Animal Nutrition should be withdrawn from circulation for adequate revision and correction. This measure is necessary not only to prevent the dissemination of concepts erroneously presented, but also to avoid unfavorable impression that the distribution of a book translated in such a way would cause on the work carried out by USAID in Brazil.

Thank you for your attention to this critical appraisal of the translation of a book which, although necessary for some time, will not fill the existing deficiency (of a good text in animal nutrition).

Prof. Aristeu Mendes Peixoto
Head of the Dept. of Animal Husbandry
ESALQ, USP.