

Social Audit in Bijepur Gram Panchayat
Titilagarh Block, Bolangir
Date: 1st February 2008

Bijepur Panchayat comes under the Titilagarh block of Bolangir district. The process of social Audit initiated with the help of some trained volunteers hailing from different districts of Orissa and also by mobilizing the local youth of Bijepur Gram Panchayat. During the process volunteers undertook household survey of all the villages of the Panchayat. The main objective behind this survey is to verify the functioning of NREGA at the same time create awareness among the villagers / beneficiaries. The volunteers sensitize the villagers on various aspects of NREG Act following various processes like organizing village meetings (especially during evening), distributing leaflets to every household during the household survey, and also organizing rallies in villages and singing songs and chanting slogans. The process of sensitization not only helped the villagers to have better understanding on NREGA but also help to build an environment for the Public Meeting of the social audit.

Finally, all these efforts of the volunteers showed result, when the volunteers could collect more than 250 filled in forms from potential beneficiaries / households to be registered under NREGA in the GP. The filled in forms were then handed over to the block officials present during the public meeting / social audit.

For the said social audit three recently completed works were taken up for verification. In this regard, at first the documents were collected from the Gram Panchayat and after consolidation, the verification exercise started. All the details which were informed by the beneficiaries and villagers and based on the observation of the volunteers, report was prepared which subsequently shared during the social audit on 1st February 2008. 12 no of Volunteers perspired to make successful the whole process of social audit. The names of the honored volunteers are:

- 1- Sanjib Kumar Pattnaik
- 2- Shaktiswar Mundi
- 3- Shatrughna Sethi
- 4- Murali Charan Bagh
- 5- Pankaj Panigrahi
- 6- Amrutlal Singh
- 7- Bishnu Sahu
- 8- Gagan Budek
- 9- Ram Kumar Pradhan
- 10- Rakesh Tirki
- 11- Ashok Kumar Putel
- 12- Sachidananda Patel

GRAM PANCHAYAT DETAIL:

Name of the GP	: Bijepur
Distance from District Headquarter	: 75 km
Numbers of Villages/ Hamlets	: 9
Name of villages/ hamlets	: Bijepur, Khubudin, Tarasinha, Ghugurpala, Nimapada, Chormara, Rigadula, Gokhurun, Chandotara
Date of Public Meeting of Social Audit	: 1 st Feb. 2008
Duration of survey process	: 23 rd Jan. to 31 st Jan. 2008
Venue	: High school field, Bijepur

Panelist and implementing officials present:

Mr. Nruparaj Sahu, Addititonal Collector
Mr. Sudhansu Sekhar Bebagarty, APD

Mr. Michel Tiza, APD
Mr. Robin Das, Asst. Engineer

Mr. Hansraj Behera, Sarpanch
Mr. Ajaya Panda Samiti Member

Mr. Promod Kumar Das, PEO

In presence of the implementing officials, more than 500 villagers (who were turned up to witness the social audit) the following facts were presented by the social audit team.

Status of Registration, Job card and Employment:

Category	House Hold		Registration		Job Card Distribution		Employment Status
	Panchayat	Survey	Panchayat	Survey	Panchayat	Survey	Survey
Bijepur	528	376	250	194	250	150	90
Khubudin	285	232	128	117	128	113	41
Tarasinha	363	269	139	155	139	155	79
Ghugurpala	83	77	80	65	80	65	21
Nimapada	31	27	25	22	25	22	12
Chormara	247	132	125	87	125	87	76
Rigadula	361	306	111	155	111	115	40
Gokhurun	319	285	276	206	272	206	39
Chandotara	35	30	21	20	21	20	11
Total	2252	1734	1155	1021	1151	933	409

- As per the records of the Panchayat, 100% of the registered households have job cards. But the team found that 91.38% of the households who have applied for registration have got job card.
- Only 23.58% of the household surveyed have been employed under NREGS. This is 43.83% of house holds who have job cards.

Findings of the team on different activities related to implementation of NREGS

The team, during the process of household survey and information provided Gram Panchayat have found the following.

Record Keeping:

All the records maintained at the Gram Panchayat under NREGA were verified by the social audit team, and the observations / major findings are given below:

- Documents like job card issues register, and registration register were not maintained properly.
- Asset register was found to be totally blank
- Registration and job demand form are not available at Gram Panchayat
- Palli Sabha and Gram Sabha resolution were not pen down properly, signature in the resolution of the general public were forged.
- Cash book which has maintained for NREGA work is hard to decipher, there is no fund for further work and cash book's entries were seemed unclear towards the purpose.

Participation of people in the NREGS (especially of women):

- ↓ No information on Gram Sabha and Palli Sabha are communicated to the people and no information on NREGS has so far provided to the people. An affidavit was made by the villagers of Nima pada regarding this fact.
- ↓ The team also got written complains from the respondents about the non participation of women in the decision making process of any developmental activities (which includes NREGS). The meeting organized by SHG members in Tarasingha village has complained on

this issue and have given a joint affidavit urging to take proper steps to ensure women participation in NREGA.

Registration:

The social audit team found that there are around % of families (as per GP record) are yet to be registered. Also the survey indicates % of households are yet to be registered in the GP. Also the following areas of implementation need to be streamlined.

- ↓ Form for registration of households is not available in the GP
- ↓ G.P office is not opening properly
- ↓ No receipts were issued against the application for registration
- ↓ Money was collected for registration
- ↓ Registration statuses of house holds were not mentioned in the notice board

The team collected more than 250 filled in forms from household for registration across the GP, and was submitted during the social audit public meeting for providing Job Cards.

Job card:

After two years of implementation of NREGA in the area there are many households that are not having a job card.

- ↓ No registration number in Job Card. This complain was made by the in the form of affidavit by the participants from Righadula village.
- ↓ Job Cards were lying with persons (contractors / middleman), other then the Job Card holders.
- ↓ The entries in the Job Card is not matching with the entries in the Muster Roll or with the statement of the beneficiaries. There is no serious effort by the Panchayat officials for keeping the Job Cards updated, for the benefit of the beneficiaries.
- ↓ There are many cases of inflated entries have been detected during the survey and many suc cases were also presented during the social audit public meeting.
- ↓ Cases of fake / false entries were also identified and presented before the gathering.
Sri Rathi Podha of Tarasingha has complained in his affidavit that he has worked for five days but 18 days has been entered in the job card.
- ↓ Collection of money for providing the Job Cards
- ↓ No Photograph in Job Cards

Note: A joint statement was given by villagers of Rigadula (Parsukana) about the irregularities relating to job card.

Demand for work:

During the survey, village meeting and focus group discussion with the beneficiaries and potential beneficiaries it was found that, the level of awareness among the villagers is very poor. The villagers does not know that NREGA / 100 days employment is their entitlement and they could get it as per their need and demand for it. Villagers are of the notion that Panchayat / Govt. will ask them to join work / supply driven.

- ↓ Job demand receipts were not given to the applicants.
- ↓ Delay in providing work to the job seeker.
- ↓ Job seekers are not getting notice after application to join the work.

Wage payment:

- ↓ No weekly payment
- ↓ Inflated and false entries in the Muster Rolls
- ↓ Different wage rate for the male and female

↓ Non payment of wages

Note- affidavits and findings of irregularities related to wage payment are discussed in the presentation on projects.

Work site facility:

Under NREGA four facilities (water, shed, first aid and crèche) has been made an entitlement of the beneficiaries. It was found that worksite entitlement ensured under the Act are eluding the beneficiaries of Bijepur GP.

- ↓ The Panchayat has not provided worksite facilities to the beneficiaries. For example, a joint affidavit of Rigadula villagers says that no such facility of first-aid was provided to the workers in project "Road from Basti to Dagalasara" (On March 2007).
- ↓ The team could collect affidavit from Gimala Kuanr who, as per records, was paid Rs660/- for providing water in CC road at Bijepur. She has complained in the affidavit that she has never received money nor there was any provision of water in the mentioned worksite.

Transparency and Accountability:

To ensure proper implementation of the NREG Act there are many provisions of transparency and accountability. It was found out that taking excuses these measures and provisions are being violated. Transparency and Accountability measures are violated deliberately.

- ↓ Muster roll was not available in the work site.
- ↓ The team found that the vigilance and monitoring committees were ineffective.
- ↓ People are not informed on the decisions Palli Sabha and Gram Sabha (affidavit discussed earlier)
- ↓ Boards lack all information related to work. Even the worker who had constructed a board was paid less then the official records.(Affidavit would be discussed in the following page)

PROJECTS UNDERTAKEN FOR SOCIAL AUDIT

Three projects were undertaken for the social audit and the detail is given below:

Sl.	Project Details	Village	Implementing Agency	Estimate	Wage	Material Component
1	Improvement of road from Tarasingh to Kundajore	Tarasingh	Panchayat Samiti, Titlagarh	Rs.150000	Rs.42900	Rs.107100
2	Improvement of road from Bijepur to Thubudinga	Bijepur	Panchayat Samiti, Titlagarh	Rs.400000	Rs.246000	Rs.154000
3	C.C. road work of Ghugurpala Basti	Ghugurpala	Grama Panchyat, Bijepur	Rs.100000	Rs.15070	Rs.89430

Project-1

Construction of road from Tarasinha to Kundajore

Name of the work	: Improvement of road from Tarasingh to Kundajore
Total Estimate	: Rs.1, 50,000
Implementing Agency	: Panchayat Samiti / Titilagarh Block
VLL	: Mr. Dolamani Majhi
Length	: 0.40 km
Work started	: 26/01/07
Work ended	: 17/04/07
No of workers	: 54 (As per MR)
Person days	: 780 (As per MR)
Wage paid	: 42,900 (As per MR)

Approved plan & estimate		Expense on records		Actual	
Labor component	36613	Wage paid	42,900	Wage Board	21193 1000
Material component	1,11,887	<u>Material</u> Board	1000	Metal & moorum	31,000*
Contingency	1500	Metal	67,596	Water	0
		Morum	21,159		
		Rent for tools	460		
		VLL	1560		
		Royalty	9715		
		TC of roller	3000		
		water	660		
		Others	2485		
Total	1,50,000	Total	1,50,535 (1,50,000)	Total	53,193**

* The team detected Rs31, 000/- has been paid out of Rs79, 153/- on metal and morrum. The team is not sure of actual expense of remaining expense of Rs8588/- on metal and Rs1014/- on morrum.

** The total expenses do not include the expense which the team did not ascertain.

Note-

1)The team is uncertain on extent of irregularity on the total project as team stressed more on labor component.

2) The team has found that dates are not mentioned in many bills and vouchers.

The team, in the process of muster roll verification have tried to contact all the beneficiaries but, due to non availability of some beneficiaries and non surety of days/ wage in labor statement, forced the team to draw conclusion on the basis of statement of 28 laborers.

From the statements of 28 beneficiaries, the team detected discrepancies as mentioned below.

- One laborers have never worked
- One worker has worked but not paid till date. Inflated entry in the MR in his name.
- Inflated entries i.e. more days and wage payment shown in the MR then the actual days and wage paid to the laborers.

To prove the cases of discrepancies, the team collected proof in the form of affidavits from the concerned workers to present them in the social audit meeting and later to the higher authority for necessary action. After the MR verification the team could calculate possible irregularity which is presented below in tabular form.

CONCLUSION OF THE TEAM ON MAN DAYS & WAGE PAYMENT

Total man days created (As per MR)-780
 Total wage paid (as per the MR)-RS42,900/-
 Survey Sample -28
 Not worked (Number) – 1
 Worked (Number) – 27 worked for 213 days and paid Rs42, 900/-

FINDINGS OF THE TEAM ON SAMPLE				
Particulars	As per Muster Roll	As per labor statement		
		Not worked	Worked	Total
Number of beneficiaries	28	1	27	28
Person days created	414	0	213	213
Wage paid	22770	0	11250	11250

Person days and wage						
As per survey			As per survey			
Person days		Wage	Person days		Wage	
Person days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Person days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Wage not Paid
% of MR	(414.-213)	% of MR	(51.44% of 780)	(780.-401)	(49.4% of 42,900/-)	(42900-21193)
213	201	11250	401.23 (401)	379	21192.60 (21193)	21707
51.44		49.4				

Findings on Person days:

The team has concluded that 401 person days have been created and 379 person days have not been created
Final conclusion on wage:
 Rs 21193/- has been paid to the workers and Rs21707/- has not gone to the workers as has been mentioned in the MR.

Case of non payment and false entry:

Name- Suresh Padmaphulia

Job card-9514

MR no- 319141 & 139137

Case- He has worked for 3 days and was not paid till date. MR shows that he has worked for 12 days and paid Rs660/-.

Case of inflated entry:

1) Name- Rathi Podha

Job card- 3969

MR no-NA

Case- He has worked for 5 days and paid Rs250/-. 24 days entered in MR and 18 days entered in job card.

2) Makha Sia

Job card-31746

MR no- NA

Case- He has worked for 3 day and paid Rs55/-(wage of one day). 12days entered in MR and 21 days entered in job card.

Unequal wage payment- The team found that women had been paid less then men.

Special finding on material component:

Jihitu Podha has given an affidavit stating that he has received Rs.31, 000/- for supply of metal and morrum in his tractor (OR-03B-7112). But the voucher shows that he was paid Rs.79, 153/- As per the records Rs59, 008 was paid for metal and Rs 20,145/- was paid for morrum. **In the affidavit he has alleged that his son (Braja Bandhu) has signed the voucher when it was blank. (Signature was taken in blank paper).**

Note: The team has found that Rs 49,153/- has not been paid.

Worksite facility:

First aid- No first aid was provided in the worksite.

Drinking water- No provision for drinking water was made though the records shows that expenditures was made for it.

Rest shed- No provision for rest shed was made.

Transparency and Accountability:

Display board was there in the work site.

Muster roll in work site- No muster roll was there in the worksite.

PROJECT-2
CC ROAD AT GHUGURAPALLA VILLAGE

Name of the work	: CC road at Ghugurapalla Village
Total Estimate cost	: Rs. 1, 00,000
Implementing agency	: Panchayat Samiti, Titlagarh
VLL	: Debraj Majhi
Work started	: 15/12/07
Work ended	: 05/01/07
No of workers	: 75 (As per MR)
Man days	: 274 (As per MR)
Wage paid	: 15,070 (As per MR)

Approved Plan & estimate: The plan and estimate given to the team was of Rs.2, 54,000/-. The team has not been provided the technical & administrative sanction. However the running bill and the order sheet shows that the estimate for the said project is Rs1, 00,000/-.

Expenditure as per records:

1) Wage payment	- Rs15, 070/- (As per MR)
2) 245 bags of cement	- Rs39, 398/-
3) Transportation of cement	- Rs1102/-
4) Board	-Rs500/-
5) Skilled labor	- Rs2300/-
6) Metal, sand, chips, morrum	-Rs36, 130/-
7) Drinking water	-Rs660/-
8) VLL	- Rs900/-
9) Royalty	- Rs2601/-
10) Contingency	- Rs1000/-
11) EG of cement	- Rs 899/-
13) Other expenses	- Rs1629/-
Total bill submitted for the said project is Rs1, 02,189/- (say Rs 1, 00,000/-)	

The team tried to ascertain the extent of irregularity in labor component by verifying the consolidated muster roll verification sheet. During the muster roll verification, the team could collect labor clear statement on man days and wage from 69 laborers. This statement from 69 laborers became the sample of the basis of which the team could ascertain the extent of irregularity on wage component.

From the statements of laborers, the team found following discrepancies

- 36 laborers have never worked
- Inflated entries i.e. more days and wage payment shown in the MR then the actual days and wage paid to the laborers.

To prove the cases of discrepancies, the team collected proof in the form of affidavits from the concerned workers to present them in the social audit meeting and later to the higher authority for necessary action. After the MR verification the team could calculate possible irregularity which is presented below in tabular form.

CONCLUSION OF THE TEAM ON MAN DAYS & WAGE PAYMENT

Total Person days created (As per MR)-274

Total wage paid (as per the MR- Rs15,070/-

Sample -69

Not worked (Number) -36

Worked (Number) - 33 worked for 108 days and paid Rs5079/-.

FINDINGS OF THE TEAM ON SAMPLE				
Particulars	As per Muster Roll	As per labor statement		
		Not worked	Worked	Total
Number of beneficiaries	69	36	33	69
Person days created	238	0	108	108
Wage paid	13090	0	5079	5079

Conclusion of the team on man days and wage						
Conclusion on sample			Conclusion on the project (based on conclusion of sample)			
Person days		Wage	Person days		Wage	
Man days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Person days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Wage not Paid
% of MR	(238-108)	% of MR	(45.37% of 274)	(274-124)	(38.8% of 15070)	(15070-5847)
108	130	5079	124.31 (124)	150	5847.16 (4847)	9223
45.37		38.8				

Final conclusion on Person days:

The team has concluded that 124 Person days have been created and 150 Person days have not been created.

Final conclusion on wage:

Rs 5847/- has been paid to the workers and Rs9223/- has not gone to the workers as has been mentioned in the MR.

Case of corruption detected during Palli Sabha:

- A joint affidavit was made after a Palli Sabha in Ghugurapalla village. In the said affidavit, the villagers have alleged that Rs5335/- have been misappropriated in the name of 27 laborers. The affidavit also indicated on the said misappropriation was done on voucher no 107&108 and following muster rolls.
Muster Roll-141126, 141127,141128,141129,141130
- Likely the villagers of the same village, on a special emergency Palli Sabha, the villagers of Ghugurapalla have detected corruption related to payment on material component like payment on sand & chips (Voucher no-109), Cement (Voucher no-110), Transport of Cement (Voucher no-111), drinking water supply (Voucher no-116).
The above mentioned Palli Sabha was held on 30.01.08.

Findings on work site facility:

- 1) No provision for drinking water was made. It should be mentioned that **Bimala Kuanar, who as per records, has been paid Rs660/- for providing drinking water has given an affidavit stating that the amount has been misappropriated by giving a false thumb impression.**
- 2) No provision for rest shed was made.
- 3) No first aid facility was available in work site.

Findings on transparency:

Display board was there in the work site.

Muster roll at work site- No muster roll was there in the worksite.

Vigilance & monitoring committee: The villagers were not aware of existence of such a committee.

PROJECT-3
IMPROVEMENT OF ROAD FROM BIJEPUR TO THUBUDINGA

Name of the work	: Improvement of road from Bijepur to Thubudinga
Executor	: Panchayat Samiti, Titlagarh
Total Estimate cost	: Rs. 400000
VLL	: Sarat Kumar Bagarti
Work started	: 16/09/06
Work ended	: 11/11/06
Total beneficiaries	: 114 (As per MR)
Man days	: 4440 (As per MR)
Total wage	: 2, 44,200 (As per MR)

Plan & estimate:

Wage to unskilled labor	- Rs.2, 46,000/-
Non wage expenses (material component)	- Rs.1, 54,000/-

Expenses as per records:

Wage	- Rs.2, 44,200 /-
Running and hire charge of PRR	-Rs.29545 /-
Drinking water	- Rs.2310/-
VLL	- Rs.3150/-
Board	- Rs.1000/-
Rent for tools	- Rs.1147 /-
Metal & transport	- Rs.36975 /-
Moorum & transport	- Rs.52275 /-
Royalty	- Rs.23768 /-
Contingency	- Rs.4002/-

While verifying the consolidated muster roll, the team found number of discrepancies and on the basis of the finding, the team could calculate the possible extent of irregularities which is presented in the table in the next page. The main discrepancies found in the project was

- Name of nonexistent workers has been mentioned in the MR (person known as Rupa Sahu has never existed)
- False entries has been made in muster roll (Brudabati Chhura is a literate and is working in Nrrantan Siksha Kendra. Her name was found in the MR though she had never worked and money withdrawn by putting thumb impression).
- Cases of inflated entries have been also found in the MR.
- The labour statement and entries in the job card differs.

It should be noted that the team detected strange cases of discrepancies. Tarani Sen of Dungari village signed as Tarani Bohi. Hirod Dungri has signed as Hirod Majhi. Similarly names of the beneficiaries have been rewritten (in the name column).

On the basis of the finding after verification of muster rolls, the team came into conclusion on possible extent of irregularity which is presented in tabular form.

CONCLUSION OF THE TEAM ON MAN DAYS & WAGE PAYMENT

Total Person days created (As per MR)-4440

Total wage paid (as per the MR)-Rs.2,44,200

Sample -58

Man days and wage of sample (Actual) - 691 days and Rs. 24845/-

FINDINGS OF THE TEAM ON SAMPLE		
Particulars	As per Muster Roll	As per labor statement
Person days created	1971	691
Wage paid	108405	24845

Conclusion of the team on man days and wage						
Conclusion on sample			Conclusion on the project (based on conclusion of sample)			
Person days		Wage	Person days		Wage	
Person days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Person days created	Person days not created	Wage paid	Wage not Paid
% of MR	(1971-691)	% of MR	(35.05% of 4440)	(4440-1556)	(22.91% of 244200)	(244200-55946)
691	1280	24845	1556.22 (1556)	2884	55946.22 (55946)	188254
35.05		22.91				

Final conclusion on Person days:

The team has concluded that 1556 Person days have been created and 2884 Person days have not been created

Final conclusion on wage:

Rs55946/- has been paid to the workers and Rs1, 88,254/- has not gone to the workers as has been mentioned in the MR.

The team, to substantiate their findings has collected individual & joint affidavits. The details of the affidavits are mentioned below.

Cases of false entry

- In an joint affidavit made by Dhanurjaya Dungri, Bhamisuta Rana, Jibardhan Rana, Mathura Bag, Bijaya Rana on false entry in the muster roll. In the said affidavit, they have alleged that they have never participated in the work and money withdrawn in their name by making false signature/ thumb impression.
- Dhina Bohi has given an affidavit stating that he has never worked and 42 days ahs been entered in the muster roll in his name.

Case of inflated entry

- Lingaraj Bag, Arakhita Majhi, Tahasila Rana have given a joint affidavit stating that more days and wage then actual has been entered in the muster roll.

Apart from the affidavits mentioned above, a general statement signed by participants of Palli Sabha held on 31/01/08 alleges the following irregularities.

- False entries have been made in the muster roll.
- Inflated entries have been made in the muster roll.
- No person known as Rupa Sahu (Father Pita Sahu) exists though the name has been entered in the muster roll.
- Dalapati Chura, s/o Mare & Pradip Podha, s/o Chaturbhuj Podha (Migrant laborers) were not present during the work. But their names have been entered into the muster roll.
- Rs 40/- per day was paid to the women and Rs50/- per day was paid to men beneficiaries.

Late payment of wage

The team found that the workers were paid on 23/10/2006 though the work started on 6/09/2006. The workers were paid after 36 days. This is an open violation of NREGA.

Findings on work site facility:

- 1) No provision for drinking water was made
- 2) No provision for rest shed was made.
- 3) No first aid facility was available in work site.

Findings on transparency:

Display board was there in the work site. **The person who constructed the board (Arakhita Majhi) has been paid Rs200/-and not Rs1000/- as mentioned in records.** Arakhita Majhi has given an affidavit stating that Rs1000/- was withdrawn in his name after making his false signature.

Muster roll at work site- No muster roll was there in the worksite.

Vigilance & monitoring committee: The villagers were not aware of existence of such a committee.

Selection of the VLL: The team found that the VLL was selected in Palli Sabha though he was not present in the said Palli Sabha.